Tracing values through the NOSH project

Clare Relton$^1$, Darren Umney$^2$, Mark Strong$^1$, Kate Thomas$^1$, Barbara Whelan$^1$, Maxine Johnson$^1$, Elaine Scott$^1$, Heather Whitford$^3$, Mary Renfrew$^3$.

1. Section of Public Health, ScHARR, University of Sheffield; 2. Design Group, Open University, Milton Keynes; 3. School of Nursing and Health Sciences, University of Dundee.
The NOSH Project

Intervention: Shopping vouchers for breastfeeding
Target population: Women in areas with low breastfeeding rates
Outcome: Breastfeeding at 6-8 weeks

Funders: Medical Research Council – National Prevention Research Initiative (MR/J000434/1)
The NOSH Project

Intervention: Shopping vouchers for breastfeeding
Target population: Women in areas with low breastfeeding rates
Outcome: Breastfeeding at 6-8 weeks

3 stages
The worst breastfeeding initiative I've ever come across

Joanna Moorhead

I believe Britain's low breastfeeding rates are a scandal. But giving shopping vouchers to low-income mothers is patronising and naive
Design research

• Explores the design process - the series of shifts in perspective as different viewpoints are assimilated into a project
  • Design precedents
  • Consultation with users
  • Production of objects
  • Controlling the frame
Design research

- Explores the design process - the series of shifts in perspective as different viewpoints are assimilated into a project
  - Design precedents
  - Consultation with users
  - Production of objects
  - Controlling the frame

Aspects of the design process
Using

• Documentary analysis of the project archive
  – early planning docs
  – formal bid for funding
  – negotiations between stakeholders
  – papers published by the team
  – press releases about the project
  – media and social media responses
Aspects of design process

- Design precedents
Aspects of design process

• Design precedents

Breastfeeding is the normal way ..... 

Virtually all mothers can breastfeed....

Exclusive breastfeeding up to 6 months
Aspects of design process

- Design precedents
Aspects of design process

• Design precedents

“incentivisation through gifts is “bribery” ..... discussion of the subject in an academic journal represents a “challenge to the core values” of the journal”
Aspects of design process

• Design precedents
• Consultation with users
Aspects of design process

• Consultation with users

• Social gradient of acceptability of the intervention
Aspects of design process

- Design precedents
- Consultation with users
- Production of objects
Aspects of design process

• Production of objects
Aspects of design process

• Production of objects
Aspects of design process

• Production of objects and how they are framed
Aspects of design process

- Design precedents
- Consultation with users
- Production of objects
- Controlling the frame
Aspects of design process

• Controlling the frame

• Launch of the feasibility study
  o ‘rampant press coverage’ (Tom Sheldon – SMC)
Aspects of design process

- Controlling the frame

- Launch of the feasibility study
  - ‘rampant press coverage’ (Tom Sheldon – SMC)
  - articles & news channels
  - 21/26 articles in UK newspapers predicted failure
  - ‘intervention unacceptable’ - online reader comments (Giles, 2015)
  - University - brand – advertising value equivalent
What have we learnt

• The design research ‘lens’ is a novel and interesting way of identifying the values in a complex and contentious environment
What have we learnt

• The design research ‘lens’ is one way of identifying the values in a complex and contentious environment
  – Precedents transmit values
What have we learnt

• The design research ‘lens’ is one way of identifying the values in a complex and contentious environment
  – Precedents transmit values
  – User consultation exposes values
What have we learnt

• The design research ‘lens’ is one way of identifying the values in a complex and contentious environment
  – Precedents transmit values
  – User consultation exposes values
  – Objects embed values
What have we learnt

• The design research ‘lens’ is one way of identifying the values in a complex and contentious environment
  – Precedents transmit values
  – User consultation exposes values
  – Objects embed values
  – Framing controls values
Conclusions

• This controversial research was interpreted and accepted/rejected in different ways by various stakeholders
Conclusions

• Research testing public health behaviour change interventions
  – Should not assume that media generated public reactions represent the considered views of the stakeholders most likely to be affected
Conclusions

• Research testing public health behaviour change interventions
  – Should not assume that media generated public reactions represent the considered views of the stakeholders most likely to be affected
  – Should not be deterred by negative public reactions, when planning and progressing research
Acknowledgements

All the different stakeholders in the projects

Previous work in the area
MRC & NPRI & PHE
Project team
Universities (Sheffield, Dundee, Brunel)
NHS REC and governance
Local Authorities
Women and men
Healthcare providers
Media
Public
UKSBM